

Aethiopica 17 (2014)

International Journal of Ethiopian and Eritrean Studies

ALESSANDRO BAUSI, Universität Hamburg

Review

LUTZ EDZARD (ed.), Semitic and Afroasiatic: Challenges and Opportunities

Aethiopica 17 (2014), 302-304

ISSN: 2194-4024

Edited in the Asien-Afrika-Institut Hiob Ludolf Zentrum für Äthiopistik der Universität Hamburg Abteilung für Afrikanistik und Äthiopistik

by Alessandro Bausi

in cooperation with

Bairu Tafla, Ulrich Braukämper, Ludwig Gerhardt, Hilke Meyer-Bahlburg and Siegbert Uhlig

Bibliographical abbreviations used in this volume

AÉ Annales d'Éthiopie, Paris 1955ff.

ÄthFor Äthiopistische Forschungen, 1–35, ed. by E. HAMMERSCHMIDT, 36–40, ed. by S. UHLIG, Stuttgart: Franz Steiner (1–34), 1977–1992; Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz (35–40), 1994–1995.

AethFor Aethiopistische Forschungen, 41–73, ed. by S. UHLIG, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1998–2011; 74–75, ed. by A. BAUSI and S. UHLIG, *ibid.*, 2011f.; 76ff. ed. by A. BAUSI, *ibid.*, 2012ff.

AION Annali dell'Università degli studi di Napoli "L'Orientale", Napoli: Università di Napoli "L'Orientale" (former Istituto Universitario Orientale di Napoli), 1929ff.

BSOAS Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies, London 1917ff.

CSCO Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium, 1903ff.

EAe S. ÜHLIG (ed.), Encyclopaedia Aethiopica, I: A–C, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2003; II: D–Ha, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2005; III: He–N, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2007; (in cooperation with A. BAUSI), IV: O–X, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2010; A. BAUSI (ed. in cooperation with S. UHLIG), V: Y–Z, Supplementa, Addenda et Corrigenda, Maps, Index, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2014.

EFAH Deutsches Archäologisches Institut, Orient-Abteilung, Epigraphische Forschungen auf der Arabischen Halbinsel, herausgegeben im Auftrag des Instituts von NORBERT NEBES.

EMML Ethiopian Manuscript Microfilm Library, Addis Ababa.

IJAHS International Journal of African Historical Studies, Boston, MA - New York 1968ff.

JAH The Journal of African History, Cambridge 1960ff.

JES Journal of Ethiopian Studies, Addis Ababa 1963ff.

JSS Journal of Semitic Studies, Manchester 1956ff.

NEASt Northeast African Studies, East Lansing, MI 1979ff.

OrChr Oriens Christianus, Leipzig – Roma – Wiesbaden 1901ff.

OrChrP Orientalia Christiana Periodica, Roma 1935ff.

PICES 15 S. UHLIG – M. BULAKH – D. NOSNITSIN – T. RAVE (eds.) 2005, Proceedings of the XVth International Conference of Ethiopian Studies, Hamburg July 20–25, 2003 = AethFor 65, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.

PICES 16 H. ASPEN – BIRHANU TEFERRA – SHIFERAW BEKELE – S. EGE (eds.) 2010, Research in Ethiopian Studies: Selected papers of the 16th International Conference of Ethiopian Studies, Trondheim July 2007 = AethFor 72, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.

PO Patrologia Orientalis, 1903ff.

RIÉ É. BERNAND – A. J. DREWES – R. SCHNEIDER 1991, Recueil des inscriptions de l'Éthiopie des périodes pré-axoumite et axoumite, I: Les documents, II: Les planches, Paris: [Académie des inscriptions et belle-lettres] Diffusion de Boccard.

RSE Rassegna di Studi Etiopici, Roma 1941–1981, Roma – Napoli 1983ff.

SAe Scriptores Aethiopici.

ZDMG Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft, Leipzig – Wiesbaden – Stuttgart 1847ff.

Aethiopica 17 (2014)

Reviews

As a general remark, Fəṣṣum's work is very useful for a general readership and provides fairly good information on the subjects, highlighting various aspects of their lives.

Abreham Adugna, Universität Hamburg

LUTZ EDZARD (ed.), Semitic and Afroasiatic: Challenges and Opportunities = Porta Linguarum Orientalium. Neue Serie 24, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 2012. 414 pp. Price: € 56.–. ISBN: 9–783447–06695–2.

The profile of this book is not immediately apparent from the title. It presents in concise and overview form extremely dense grammatical sketches of languages from the whole spectrum of Afroasiatic, namely Egyptian, Berber, Cushitic, Chadic, and though shortly also Omotic (*sub iudicio*, but cautiously included), along with sample texts for each language with linguistic annotation and interlinear translation. The Semitic is excluded and no sketch of any Semitic language is given (only a few basic features are presented in the introduction and *passim* in each chapter, sometimes in the footnotes, mainly from a contrastive point of view). This is due to the fact that the target reader are the Semitists themselves, who are invited to look at their own data from a wider and new perspective, by getting acquainted with the essentials of linguistic structures from the whole range of Afroasiatic. There is no prejudicial statement or hypothesis, however, on the nature of Afroasiatic as such, its classification and internal affinities or its history and development, and even much diverging hypotheses are presented as neutrally as possible.

The book includes an "Introduction: Semitic and Afroasiatic" (pp. 23–58) by the editor, Lutz Edzard; and then chapters on "Egyptian" (Earlier and Later Egyptian; pp. 59–130) by Ruth Kramer; "Berber" (pp. 131–198) by Mohamed Elmedlaoui; "Cushitic" (Overview, Beja, Bilin, Oromo, Somali, Sidaama, Iraqw, pp. 199–295), by David Appleyard, with "Sidaama" (pp. 262–277) by Kjell Magne Yri; "Chadic" (Overview, Kulere, Mubi, Mushere, Tangale, pp. 296–368) by Herrmann Jungraithmayr; "Omotic" (pp. 369–384) by Rolf Theil with a "Sketch Grammar of an Omotic Language: Koorete" (pp. 385–398) by Binyam Sisay Mendisu. Every grammatical sketch is accompanied by a short section on the lexicon. The bibliography follows each chapter. After the table of contents (pp. 5–13) there is a list of tables (pp. 14–17) and of abbreviations (pp. 18–20), mostly consisting of the abbreviations for internal annotation that are oriented to the "Leipzig glossing rules". An index of subjects (pp. 399–410) and of authors (pp. 411–414) complete the volume.

Ababa University, 1982 A.M. [1990 A.D.]; ELISABETH W. GIYORGIS et. al. (eds.), *Gebre Kristos Desta: The Painter-Poet*, Addis Ababa: Institute of Ethiopian Studies, 2006.

Reviews

With respect of these premises, the book is of innovative conception, although the structure of a series of grammatical sketches plus sample texts (as the editor declares, p. 21) is directly inspired by the model of Gotthelf Bergsträsser's *Einführung in die semitischen Sprachen: Sprachproben und grammatische Skizzen*,¹ but the perspective it offers to the general Semitist and Afroasiatist is of a completely different scale.

A few more detailed remarks: p. 30: (table 10) it escapes the reader why it seems necessary to adduce an example from an Amerindian language (diiyl / diyl-inay / diyiil-aa-n, etc.) to demonstrate that the principle of "a consonantal root, modified by template affixes is not restricted to Afroasiatic": the example provided resembles Indoeuropean apophony, cf. Greek leip-ō, e-lip-on, le-loip-a; and the question of the vocalic element also in Semitic can not be ruled out so simply, cf. the old but still valid contribution by Pelio Fronzaroli.² – p. 34, (d): there are a few errors in the verbal tables: the s-t-G (= Dillmann IV,1) perfect form is not, or not as a rule, ä-s-t-äC₁äC₂äC₃ä; it is rather a-s-t-äC₁C₂äC₃ä (for example astäqtälä, always with an astä- prefix) or a-s-t-äC₁äC₂C₃ä; the °-D (= Dillmann II,2) imperfect form is not $yaC_1eC_2C_2\ddot{a}C_3$, but $yaC_1eC_2C_2\partial C_3$; the s-t-L (= Dillmann IV,3) perfect form is not ä-s-t-äC₁aC₂äC₃ä, but a-s-t-äC₁aC₂äC₃ä. – p. 40: "hezb" for "həzb", "kanāfer" for "känafər", "mawā el" for "mäwa əl" do not make clear which transcription system is adopted for $G \ni^c \ni z$ (whether a/\bar{a} or \ddot{a}/a for first and fourth order, and ϑ or e for the sixth), with all previous examples adopting a different transcription system than the one adopted here. - p. 41, l. 3 from the bottom (no. iv): Amh. "awnät-wa-n" for "awnät-wa-n", and l. 6 (no. iii): the expression can be considered adverbial only in a contrastive or cross-linguistic perspective: it is actually an object. - p. 42: here tacitly emerges an "original Afroasiatic" (p. 42, "originally Afroasiatic"), that contradicts some of the premises of the introduction (pp. 25–26). – p. 46: the idea that the Sudan Nubian is the ultimate responsible for the SOV structure of Amharic via Cushitic intermediary seems to belong to another sphere of reflections than that adopted for this volume. - p. 47: the Cushitic etymology of "ate" (Appleyard) remains a possibility, but among other, cf. the comprehensive presentation by D. Nosnitsin, "Aşe".3 - p. 48: the negation "ay" is attested exactly in this form in Ethio-Semitic (for example in Təgrəñña). 4 – p. 50: the famous Italian scholar in Indoeuropean linguistics is "Vittore Pisani" (1899-1990), not "Vittorio". - p. 68, n. 7: "verbal nouns in the adverbial accusative" in Gə^oəz hint at the gerundive or converb; the gerundive, however,

¹ G. BERGSTRÄSSER, Einführung in die semitischen Sprachen: Sprachproben und grammatische Skizzen, München: Max Hueber, 1928, repr. several times; Engl. transl. by P.T. DANIELS, Introduction to the Semitic Languages: Text Specimens and Grammatical Sketches, Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns, 1983.

² P. FRONZAROLI, "Sull'elemento vocalico del lessema in semitico", *Rivista degli Studi* Orientali 38, 1963, pp. 119–129.

³ D. NOSNITSIN, "Aṣe", in: *EAe* II, pp. 364b–365b.

⁴ Cf. now M. BULAKH, "Negative markers *'ay-, *'i- and *'al in Ethio-Semitic", in: L. KOGAN –N.V. KOSLOVA – S. LOESOV – S.V. TISCHCHENKO (eds.), *Babel und Bibel: Annual of Ancient Near Eastern, Old Testament, and Semitic Studies* 6 = Orientalia Classica: Papers of the Institute of the Institute of Oriental and Classical Studies 43, Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns, 2012, pp. 385–420.

Reviews

also exists in Ethio-Semitic, besides accusative, from a nominative basis (for example in Təgrəñña). – The volume has a certain series of trivial errors, for example p. 37, l. 18: "qualitative of quantitative"; p. 39, l. 11: "prefect" for "perfect"; again, also in the tables, p. 39, l. 22: "her forgets" for "he forgets"; p. 97, no. (42): "hegospel" for "the-gospel"; less trivial, unfortunately, is p. 97, no. (43): "NAXAPIZE for "NAXAPIZE (scil. from Greek χαρίζομαι); what is worse, the verb form is transcribed "f-na-čarize" as according to the wrong Coptic spelling, instead of "f-na-charize".

From an editor who is well known for having stressed the importance of polygenesis, convergence, and entropy,⁵ one would have expected more consideration for "drift" and internal development phenomena, and for interference as well, not only from within the Afroasiatic macrofamily. For example, the gemination of the types Akkadian *iparras*, Ethiopic *yaqattal* (pp. 37–38) are considered only in the Afroasiatic and specifically Semitic dimension, without taking into account parallel convergence phenomena, as supposed by David Cohen, who suggests a secondary gemination for *yaqattal*. To stress the limits and the *caveat* towards a hazardous comparatism would have not been superfluous: at a conference on Afroasiatic I eyewitnessed debates concerning the non-Semitic and possibly Egyptian or Cushitic origin of the Təgrəñña genitive particle *nay*—, definitely to be explained as an internal development from *nəway*, "goods, property", as stated as early as by Fr. Praetorius,⁶ and as is confirmed by a well known typology of parallel genitive constructions.

All in all, this book soundly reminds all specialists of single Afroasiatic languages, and Semitic in particular, that a comprehensive consideration of Afroasiatic is fruitful and seminal for understanding better particular phenomena, be it from a historical comparative or typological linguistic point of view. There is no need to say that this is particularly true for specialists in Ethio-Semitic, since the relatively narrow and small Ethiopian linguistic area uniquely includes three of the Afroasiatic linguistic families (namely, Semitic, Cushitic, and Omotic, plus non-Afroasiatic languages). With respect to this, the very fine chapter by David Appleyard – one of the few scholars really able to encompass masterly Cushitic and Ethio-Semitic languages basing on first-hand sources – recommends itself as one of the pièces de résistance of the volume.

Alessandro Bausi, Universität Hamburg

See his L. EDZARD, Polygenesis, Convergence, and Entropy: An Alternative Model of Linguistic Evolution. Applied to Semitic Linguistics, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1998.

⁶ F. Praetorius, *Grammatik der Tigriñasprache in Abessinien*, Halle: Verlag der Buchhandlung des Weisenhauses, 1871, p. 211.