



Aethiopia 17 (2014)

International Journal of Ethiopian and
Eritrean Studies

VERENA BÖLL, Dresden

Review

JÖRG HAUSTEIN, *Writing Religious History: The Historiography of
Ethiopian Pentecostalism*

Aethiopia 17 (2014), 283–287

ISSN: 2194–4024

Edited in the Asien-Afrika-Institut
Hiob Ludolf Zentrum für Äthiopistik
der Universität Hamburg
Abteilung für Afrikanistik und Äthiopistik

by Alessandro Bausi

in cooperation with

Bairu Tafla, Ulrich Braukämper, Ludwig Gerhardt,
Hilke Meyer-Bahlburg and Siegbert Uhlig

Bibliographical abbreviations used in this volume

- AE* *Annales d'Éthiopie*, Paris 1955ff.
- ÄthFor* Äthiopistische Forschungen, 1–35, ed. by E. HAMMERSCHMIDT, 36–40, ed. by S. UHLIG, Stuttgart: Franz Steiner (1–34), 1977–1992; Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz (35–40), 1994–1995.
- AethFor* Aethiopistische Forschungen, 41–73, ed. by S. UHLIG, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1998–2011; 74–75, ed. by A. BAUSI and S. UHLIG, *ibid.*, 2011f.; 76ff. ed. by A. BAUSI, *ibid.*, 2012ff.
- AION* *Annali dell'Università degli studi di Napoli "L'Orientale"*, Napoli: Università di Napoli "L'Orientale" (former Istituto Universitario Orientale di Napoli), 1929ff.
- BSOAS* *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*, London 1917ff.
- CSCO* *Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium*, 1903ff.
- EAE* S. UHLIG (ed.), *Encyclopaedia Aethiopica*, I: A–C, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2003; II: D–Ha, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2005; III: He–N, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2007; (in cooperation with A. BAUSI), IV: O–X, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2010; A. BAUSI (ed. in cooperation with S. UHLIG), V: Y–Z, *Supplementa, Addenda et Corrigenda, Maps, Index*, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 2014.
- EFAH* Deutsches Archäologisches Institut, Orient-Abteilung, Epigraphische Forschungen auf der Arabischen Halbinsel, herausgegeben im Auftrag des Instituts von NORBERT NEBES.
- EMML* Ethiopian Manuscript Microfilm Library, Addis Ababa.
- IJAHS* *International Journal of African Historical Studies*, Boston, MA – New York 1968ff.
- JAH* *The Journal of African History*, Cambridge 1960ff.
- JES* *Journal of Ethiopian Studies*, Addis Ababa 1963ff.
- JSS* *Journal of Semitic Studies*, Manchester 1956ff.
- NEASt* *Northeast African Studies*, East Lansing, MI 1979ff.
- OrChr* *Oriens Christianus*, Leipzig – Roma – Wiesbaden 1901ff.
- OrChrP* *Orientalia Christiana Periodica*, Roma 1935ff.
- PICES 15* S. UHLIG – M. BULAKH – D. NOSNITSIN – T. RAVE (eds.) 2005, *Proceedings of the XVth International Conference of Ethiopian Studies, Hamburg July 20–25, 2003* = *AethFor* 65, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.
- PICES 16* H. ASPEN – BIRHANU TEFERRA – SHIFERAW BEKELE – S. EGE (eds.) 2010, *Research in Ethiopian Studies: Selected papers of the 16th International Conference of Ethiopian Studies, Trondheim July 2007* = *AethFor* 72, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.
- PO* *Patrologia Orientalis*, 1903ff.
- RIÉ* É. BERNAND – A. J. DREWES – R. SCHNEIDER 1991, *Recueil des inscriptions de l'Éthiopie des périodes pré-axoumite et axoumite*, I: *Les documents*, II: *Les planches*, Paris: [Académie des inscriptions et belle-lettres] Diffusion de Boccard.
- RSE* *Rassegna di Studi Etiopici*, Roma 1941–1981, Roma – Napoli 1983ff.
- SAe* *Scriptores Aethiopici*.
- ZDMG* *Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft*, Leipzig – Wiesbaden – Stuttgart 1847ff.

Aethiopica 17 (2014)

Reviews

alism can serve as an instrument of conflict management and prevention in ethnically diverse societies. It undoubtedly opens valuable insights into the above-mentioned spheres, but overly optimistic expectations with regard to their implementation by the political actors will most probably be disappointed.

Ulrich Braukämper, Georg-August-Universität Göttingen

JÖRG HAUSTEIN, *Writing Religious History: The Historiography of Ethiopian Pentecostalism* = Studien zur Außereuropäischen Christentums-geschichte (Asien, Afrika, Lateinamerika) 17/Studies in the History of Christianity in the Non-Western World 17, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz Verlag, 2011. XVI + 295 pp. Price: € 38.–. ISBN: 978-3-447-06528-3.

The first national Pentecostal church, the Full Gospel Believer's Church (FGBC), Mulu Wängel in Amharic, was founded in Addis Abäba in 1967. Shortly after seven Ethiopians were ordained by Swedish Pentecostal missionaries, the FGBC applied for registration as a religious association in accordance with the 1960 Civil Code and "Legal Notice No. 321". However, this first application was dismissed. Not long after this event, a split over doctrinal disputes resulted in the foundation of the Apostolic Church of Ethiopia, and in 1974, the Gospel Deliverance Church separated from the FGBC. The Gennet (Gännät) Church was founded by Finnish missionaries at the Addis Abäba Märkato area in 1978. In 1980, the Harvest Church of God was founded after splitting from the Gennet Church, and in 1975, the Swedish Philadelphia Church Mission formed the Hiwot Berhan (Həywät Bərhan) Church in Awasa.¹ The number of new foundations soared in the 1990s with newly established churches including the Gubae Egziabiher (Guba'e Egzi'abəher) Church, the Bible Army Church, the Gospel Light Church, the Maranata Church, the Evangelical Praise Church, the Rhema Faith Church and the Winners' Chapel. In 2004, 288 Protestant religious organizations, many with a Pentecostal or Charismatic background, were registered in the Federal Republic of Ethiopia.² Further denominations are often formed as a result of splits, such as the Ethiopian Full Gospel Believers

¹ With regard to the names, the spelling used by the churches is applied.

² J. LAUNHARDT, "Protestantism", in: *E Ae* IV, pp. 223b–227a, here 226b. Haustein refers to a list he compiled in 2009, which is available online: J. HAUSTEIN, "Pentecostal and Charismatic Churches in Ethiopia", <http://www.glopent.net/Members/jhaustein/ethiopia/pentecostal-charismatic-churches-in-ethiopia>; last access: 29 July 2014.

Church Bate Local,³ founded in 1995 at Haramaya University (Alämayya), and the Ketena Hulet Mulu Wongel (Kätäna Hulät Mulu Wängel) Church, which claims to be the only Protestant church not founded by Baptist, Presbyterian, Lutheran or Mennonite missions.⁴ In addition, there are numerous new church foundations by Ethiopians abroad, such as the Full Gospel Church in the USA.⁵

All this might read like a factual historic report. However, a diversity of sometimes conflicting source material had to be gathered, organized and analysed to obtain the information. For instance, different contemporary witness reports date the ordination of the seven Ethiopians mentioned at the beginning to either October 1966, Christmas 1966 or January 1967 (p. 133). Other sources fail to mention the ordination completely with the intention to negate the involvement of the Pentecostal mission (p. 134) or accredit the ordination to the Swedish Philadelphia Church Mission. Still other reports claim that the ordination was carried out by missionary Karl Ramstrand. Ramstrand himself, however, stresses that he was in Sweden at that time (p. 135). These different accounts of the birth of the FGBC illustrate the diversity with which history is adopted and give us an idea of how religious history is made.

With his studies, Haustein aims at exposing the historicist portrayals of the Ethiopian Pentecostalism since the 1950s. Rather than chronicling the history of the Pentecostal churches, he describes the way the different identities of the denominations developed and how the churches themselves present the historic process of their formation. For this purpose, Haustein conducts field studies and works with documentary material in Ethiopia and in archives in Europe (Sweden, Finland, World Council of Churches at Geneva). He conducts his research on three field trips to Ethiopia, staying in Addis Abäba, Bahär Dar and Awasa. During those stays, which last for two or three months each, he visits 66 different gatherings in 21 denominations and conducts 115 face-to-face interviews as well as 15 phone interviews. Haustein also acquires original written documents from the individual churches. He analyses unpublished papers and theses, including material contributed by the Mekane Yesus Seminary and the Ethiopian Graduate School of Theology (see *Bibliography*). By systematically comparing the information provided by his interview partners with other sources,

³ See http://www.batefullgospel.org.et/Bate_Full_Gospe_Church.php; last access: 16 March 2014.

⁴ See http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ketena_Hulet_Mulu_Wongel_church; last access: 16 March 2014.

⁵ See <http://www.muluwongelseattle.org/>; last access: 16 March 2014.

Haustein tries to trace the lores surrounding the history of the churches' formation back to their roots, often resulting in a demythologization of their historiography (e.g. p. 236 regarding the Charismatic revival in Gore, Illubabor and at the Addis Ababa Mekane Yesus Seminary).⁶ The extensive quotes from his interviews that Haustein includes in his study can be used as primary sources by fellow researchers. Haustein is aware that his personal choice of stories and quotes, historical accounts and other source material itself has an impact on the writing of history, and that in the future the historiography he has recorded will be passed on, as it is written in his book.

The book contains five chapters and a conclusion.

The first chapter (*Introduction: Parameters for a History of Ethiopian Pentecostalism*) gives a brief summary of the formation and the spreading of the Pentecostal churches in Ethiopia. Haustein also outlines the development of the Charismatic movements within the three main Protestant churches, namely the Kale Heywet (Qalä Həywät) Church, the Evangelical Church Mekane Yesus and the Meserete Kristos (Mäsärätä Krəstos) Church, whose set of beliefs include spiritual gifts (p. 19), while emphasizing the difficulty of drawing a clear distinction between Charismatic and Pentecostal movements. Throughout his research, Haustein takes into account the political systems of the "Imperial Ethiopia", the "Socialist Dictatorship" and "the time after the Derg" by factoring in the legal circumstances during the times of the monarchy, the dictatorship and the present Federal Republic of Ethiopia, where the Freedom of Religion has been enshrined in law since 1995.

In the second chapter (*Relating to Missionary Beginnings: The Finnish and Swedish Pentecostal Missions in Ethiopia*) he summarizes the beginnings of Pentecostalism using the method described above. The Finnish mission claims to have carried out the first baptism in the Holy Spirit during the Bible Week in 1962 (p. 41). This event is said to have led to the independent foundation of the Full Gospel Churches of Ethiopia. However, the Swedish mission credits themselves for the same event. And Kenyan missionary Chacha Omaha of the Pentecostal Evangelistic Fellowship of Africa (founded by ELIM), who has been working as a missionary in Ethi-

⁶ See G. ARÉN, *Envoy of the Gospel in Ethiopia: In the Steps of the Evangelical Pioneers 1898–1936*, Stockholm: EFS-förlaget, 1999; K.J. LUNDSTRÖM – EZRA GEBREMEDHIN, *Kenisha: The Roots and Development of the Evangelical Church of Eritrea 1866–1935*, Trenton, NJ – Uppsala: The Red Sea Press, 2011; TIBEBE ESHETE, *The Evangelical Movement in Ethiopia: Resistance and Resilience*, Waco, TX: Baylor University Press, 2009.

opia since 1963, maintains that an audience of 165 people received the Holy Spirit through him and spoke in tongues (p. 70). Who is right?

Haustein's analysis is explored more deeply in the third chapter (*Discovering Origins: Ethiopian Revival Movements and the Foundation of a Pentecostal Church*). He presents data that has been used by the individual churches in chronicling the history of their formation. In this chapter, Haustein introduces a new narrative strand recounting the spiritual awakening experience of young students at the Haile Selassie I University in Addis Abäba in 1965. In many self-portrayals, this event is deemed the birth of the revival movement, which reportedly resulted in the formation of the Pentecostal churches (p. 90). By focussing on the spiritual awakening experience of the Ethiopian students, the importance of the missionaries' influence is diminished. Haustein proceeds to analyse how the revival movements are portrayed in the source material provided by the individual missions and the student movement. He concludes that the "identities of the early revival movements and the key events in the formation of the FGBC were not simply 'found' in the past, but formed and created by the historical discourse of Ethiopian Pentecostals" (p. 136).

Chapter four (*Defining the Politics of Persecution: Pentecostals in the Ethiopian Empire*) looks at the political circumstances that led to the religious persecution of the denominations.

In the fifth chapter (*Accounting for the Underground: Persecution and the Proliferation of Pentecostalism during the Derg*), the focus is widened to include the Ethiopian Orthodox Church and the mainline Protestant churches. With regard to the persecution, Haustein discovers that the contemporary witnesses tend to exaggerate their own experiences to make them appear more significant in comparison to other churches (p. 228).

In some instances, churches claim their association with persecuted or imprisoned members from other denominations. Previous historiography often notes that the Pentecostal churches began to grow as a result of the persecution, and that they functioned well during the time of the persecution (p. 236). The Charismatic movements, for instance, which also happened within the Evangelical Church Mekane Yesus, are attributed to persecuted Pentecostals. Yet, even though Haustein provides detailed evidence that, based on his source material, this dating must be incorrect, it has been adopted by general historiography (p. 239).

Analysing the relationship between language and politics, Haustein tries to define the denotation of "Pente", with particular regard to the demarcation of Pentecostalism from the Charismatic movement. The term "Pente" originally only referred to the Pentecostals. During the *Därg* regime (1974–1991), however, it became a designation for all Protestant churches. The term is still in

use today, though usually without the derogatory connotation attached to it during the time of the *Därg* (p. 229). Haustein discovers that the first mission to actually carry the term “Pentecostalism” in its name was the United Pentecostal Mission, which has been present in the country since 1968 (p. 230). This mission belonged to the United Pentecostal Church and represented the Oneness Pentecostalism. Haustein also mentions that as a result of the non-trinitarian teaching and the political consequences of the monarchy and the *Därg*, for a brief time, the Pentecostal churches and Jehovah’s Witnesses were considered identical. Haustein then explains that the FGBC initially refused to adopt the term “Pentecost” for themselves since every church experiences the Pentecost as a blessing (p. 231, fn. 242).

In his conclusion (*Conclusion: Writing Religious History*), Haustein seeks to perform a meta-level analysis of the process that led to the formation of the denominations’ historiography based on the four categories of Narrativity, Discourse, Genealogy and Context.

Haustein’s monograph was accepted by the Faculty of Theology at the University of Heidelberg as doctoral dissertation in 2009 and was only slightly revised for purposes of publication, which could be a point of criticism, since a more severe editing could have produced a more systematic and detailed presentation of the findings. It is tempting to make intensive use of the comprehensive source material. The methodological considerations reflect the current standard of writing religious history. However, the conclusion is incomprehensive, and it would have been preferable if the subject of the conclusion would have been discussed in a more detailed, in-depth article. Theological questions are only briefly touched upon, and dogmatic discussions are rarely found in Haustein’s book. The brief index should definitely be extended. By introducing a well thought-out index, Haustein’s book could serve as a reference book, making it more easily accessible to a broader audience. *The List of Informants* is of particular interest as it shows the large diversity of the denominations. This list should be digested before reading the book. The inclusion of a list of all currently registered Pentecostal churches as well as a chronological table would also be beneficial to readers.

Conclusion: Haustein’s book establishes the basis for the historiography of Ethiopian Pentecostalism. He masters the balancing act of introducing his readers to the varied history of the Pentecostal churches whilst explaining his development of their historiography. He thus aptly demonstrates that even in science, everything has to be interpreted contextually, not least contemporary witness reports. On that account, perhaps Haustein’s book can be the catalyst for the rewriting of the history of Ethiopia.

Verena Böll, Dresden