

## Aethiopica 3 (2000)

# International Journal of Ethiopian and Eritrean Studies

### Alessandro Bausi

### Review

VERONIKA SIX, Äthiopische Handschriften vom Ṭānāsee Teil 3. Nebst einem Nachtrag zum Katalog der äthiopischen Handschriften deutscher Bibliotheken und Museen

Aethiopica 3 (2000), 267-276

ISSN: 1430-1938

Published by

Universität Hamburg Asien Afrika Institut, Abteilung Afrikanistik und Äthiopistik Hiob Ludolf Zentrum für Äthiopistik VERONIKA SIX, Äthiopische Handschriften vom Ṭānāsee Teil 3. Nebst einem Nachtrag zum Katalog der äthiopischen Handschriften deutscher Bibliotheken und Museen, *Verzeichnis der Orientalischen Handschriften in Deutschland* Band XX, 3 (Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag Stuttgart, 1999) 508 pp. DM 240 ISBN 3-515-03035-2.

The book opens with a dedication Ernst Hammerschmidt In Memoriam (p. 5), the great scholar to whose scientific effort is due the 1968 expedition and the following establishment of the Tanasee microfilm collection of mss., preserved at present in the "Staatsbibliothek Preußischer Kulturbesitz", Berlin. As stated in the Foreword (pp. 9-14), the volume under review was originally conceived as the third and last one (after Verzeichnis der Orientalischen Handschriften in Deutschland [= VOHD] XX, 1-2 by E. HAMMERSCHMIDT in 1973-77) dedicated to the Ṭānāsee collection (actually part "A" of the vol., 71 mss., n° 1–71, pp. [50]–250: n° 1-67 = Ṭānāsee [= Ṭ.] 112-178 = Dāgā Estifānos [= D.E.] 1-67; n° 68-71 = Tānāsee 179 = Qwarātā Walatta Pētros, T. 180–181 = Madhānē Alam 1–2, Gondar, and Ţ. 182 = Qaḥa Iyasus, Gondar), but in course of time it has incorporated the catalogues of other libraries (part "B" of the vol., as a supplement to VOHD XX, 4-6, 136 mss.): five mss. in the "Thüringer Universitäts- und Landesbibliothek", Jena (n° 72-76, pp. 252-257); one ms. in the "Universitätsbibliothek", Kiel (n° 77, pp. 258-263); 42 mss. in the "Bayerische Staatsbibliothek", München, acquired since the publication of the catalogue by the A. herself (VOHD XX, 5 in 1989) ( $n^{\circ}$  78–122 = Cod aeth. 111–113 and 122–163, pp. 264–344); 56 scrolls of the Kriss collection, acquired by the "Bayerisches Nationalmuseum", München (n° 123-178, pp. 345-400); three mss. of the "Museum für Völkerkunde", München (n° 179–181, pp. 401–408); one ms. in the "Völkerkundliches Museum", Witzenhausen (n° 182, pp. 409-411); one ms. in the "Johannes A Lasco Bibliothek", Emden (n° 183, pp. 412–413: this is described in a Nachtrag together with the following ones); one ms. in the "Niedersächsische Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek", Göttingen (n° 184, p. 414); four mss. in the "Münsterschwarzach Abtei" (n° 185–188, pp. 415–422); fourteen mss. in the "Archäologisches Landesmuseum der Christian-Albrechts-Universität", Schloß Gottorf, Schleswig (n° 189–202, pp. 423–441: the mss. now in the museum were part of the larger private collection of Mrs. E. DETTENBERG-WEDDIG); and finally five mss. in the "Staatsbibliothek Preußischer Kulturbesitz", Berlin, acquired after the publication of the catalogue by E. HAMMERSCHMIDT and the A. (VOHD XX, 4 in 1983) (n° 203–207, pp. 442– 449). Useful information is also given (p. 10) on the Tübingen mss. of the E. LITTMANN collection (catalogued by M. KAMIL in 1936): they are now in the Library of the "Deutsche Morgenländische Gesellschaft" (= DMG) in Halle an der Saale, in fulfilment of LITTMANN's will, who bequeathed his mss. to the DMG on condition that after a Vereinigung they should be returned there; in the meanwhile the mss. were preserved in the West Germany DMG Library of Mainz University, see also R. BEYLOT & M. RODINSON, Répertoire des bibliothèques et des catalogues de manuscrits éthiopiens, *Documents, études et répertoires publiés par l'IRHT* (Paris-Turnhout: CNRS-Brepols, 1995) 76. The mss. in the "Universitäts-bibliothek" in Tübingen (summarily described by H. VON EWALD in 1844–47) will probably be the object of a new catalogue. Also a mention must be made here of the mss. of the Zürich University (39 mss.), quite recently catalogued by the A., Die aethiopischen Handschriften des Völkerkundemuseums der Universität Zürich, *Oriens Christianus* 80 (1996) 116–152; 81 (1997) 127–147, and Die äthiopischen Handschriften des Völkerkundemuseums der Universität Zürich. Annäherung an das Fremde, *Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft* Suppl. 2 (1998) 121–126.

Part "A" is almost entirely devoted to mss. of the monastery of Dāgā Estifānos: its foundation dates not later than to 1252/53 A.D., but no ms. of that age has survived. The monastic library is very precious both in consideration of the age of the mss. (only four date from the XIX-XX c., eleven from the XV c. and two from the XIV c.) and contents (mainly Theological, Hagiographical, Apocryphal and Pseudo-Apostolical texts), as the A. had already pointed out in a first sketch, Manuscripts from Lake Ṭānā: Part 3: Dāgā Estifānos et alia, in H.G. MARCUS (ed.), New Trends in Ethiopian Studies. Ethiopia 94. Papers of the 12th International Conference of Ethiopian Studies, 2 voll. (Lawrenceville, NJ: The Read Sea Press) vol. I, 1321–1322. The monastic library was all the more large as part of it (28 mss.) was acquired by ANT. D'ABBADIE and is now in the Bibliothèque Nationale in Paris. The added notes of various subjects, combined with those in the Ṭānā mss. of the d'Abbadie collection, can allow to sketch a "complete mosaic" of the history of Dāgā Estifānos, see also S. UHLIG, Les marginalia des manuscrits éthiopiens. Le cas des manuscrits du lac Tānā, in A. ROUAUD (éd.), Les orientalistes sont des aventuriers. Guirlande offerte à Joseph Tubiana par ses élèves et ses amis, "Bibliothèque Peiresc" 12 (Saint-Maur: Éditions SÉPIA, 1999) 97-101, and the paper by the A., Does rim exist in land charters of Lake Tana manuscripts?, presented at the "International Workshop on Rim Land in Historical Ethiopia, January 15-16, 1999, Università degli Studi di Bologna, Dipartimento di Discipline Storiche", under press in the Proceedings. On the contrary, very little is found on Hiruta 'Amlāk, the founder of Dāgā: the only literary source about his activity was Gadla 'Iyasus Mo'a, but the "short" or "shortened" recension in the ms. n° 53 (Ţ. 164 = D.E. 53) – aččer "short" is in a note of the ms. itself, see p. 210 – does not even mention him. This could be due to the preponderant influence of Ḥayq 'Estifānos, the monastery founded by 'Iyasus Mo'a, evidenced by the presence in Dāgā of a ms. of *Gadla Takla Haymānot* in the Dabra Ḥayq version (n° 51, Ṭ. 162 = D.E. 51). An opposite counterbalancing influence from Dabra 'Asbo (later Dabra Libānos) seems however possible. Later on, the Dāgā monastery was also touched by the missionary activity of Yāfqeranna 'Egzi' (XIV c.). The Ṭānāsee collection comprises also a *Gadla Walatta Pēṭros* and three recent mss. from Gondarine churches, one of which (n° 69, Ṭ. 180 = Madḥānē 'Ālam 1), belonging in the XX c., testifies to the survival of a high level tradition in the production of mss.

Here follow some remarks on a selected number of mss., mostly in the Tānāsee collection: these constitute the most important part from the literary point of view, while scrolls and liturgical or more usual texts are the great majority in part "B" (where e.g. there are no less than 14 *Mazmura Dāwit* and 88 scrolls), with some important exceptions. No need to say that unrespectful of this, the A. has accomplished her task applying all the same excellent standard to even the smallest item. By far the larger number of the mss. are written in Ge<sup>c</sup>ez, while there are few Amharic texts.

 $N^{\circ}$  3 and 30 (T. 114 and 141 = D.E. 3 and 30) are  $Ta^{\circ}\bar{a}mera^{\circ}Iyasus$ , with the Letters of Abgar and Jesus. There are some recent studies on these texts: S. GERÖ, The Ta'amra 'Iyasūs: A Study of Textual and Source-Critical Problems, in TADDESE BEYENE (ed.), Proceedings of the Eighth International Conference of Ethiopian Studies, University of Addis Ababa, 1984, 2 voll. (Addis Ababa: Institute of Ethiopian Studies, Frankfurt am Main: Frobenius Institut, J.W. Goethe Universität, 1988-89) vol. I, 165-170; S. VOICU, Notes sur l'histoire du texte de l'Histoire de l'enfance de Jésus, Apocrypha 2 (1991) 119-132; W. WITAKOWSKI, The Miracles of Jesus: An Ethiopian Apocryphal Gospel, *Apocrypha* 6 (1995) 279–298, and The Magi in the Ethiopian Tradition, Aethiopica 2 (1999) 69–89; in general, see R.-G. COQUIN, Un nouveau témoin de la "lettre (apocryphe) de Jésus à Abgar" (recension copte), Bulletin de l'Institut Français d'Archéologie Orientale 93 (1993) 173-178; A. DESREUMAUX, Histoire du roi Abgar et de Jésus. Présentation et traduction du texte syriaque intégral de La Doctrine d'Addaï et en appendices Traduction d'une version grecque par Andrew Palmer. Traduction d'une version éthiopienne par Robert Beylot, Apocryphes. Collection de poche de l'AELAC 3 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1993), esp. 147-152; J.G. NUÑEZ, La leyenda del rey Abgar y Jesús. Con el complemento de la traducción y anotación del texto griego de los Hechos del apóstol Tadeo y de la Epistula Abgari, y de la versión

etiópica de la Leyenda de Abgar y Jesús, según la traducción inglesa de G. Haile, *Apócrifos cristianos* 1 (Madrid etc.: Editorial Ciudad Nueva – Fundación San Justino, 1995), esp. 193–202; D.V. PROVERBIO, *Un nuovo testimone copto del* Responsum Christi ad Abgarum, *Miscellanea Marciana* 12 (1997 [1998]) (= *Scritti in memoria di Emilio Teza*) 155–169. A critical edition of the different Ethiopic recensions of the *Letters of Abgar and Jesus* is being prepared by P. MARRASSINI for a collective volume in the *Corpus Christianorum. Series Apocryphorum*.

N° 6 (T. 117 = D.E. 6) and 182 (Völkerkundliches Museum, Witzenhausen, 1219, 1244) contain Gadla Gabra Manfas Qeddus with Miracles. See also P. MARRASSINI, La "Vie" de Gabra Manfas Qeddus: Hypothèse Pour un Stemma Codicum, in AN. A. GROMYKO (ed.), *Proceedings of the Ninth International Congress of Ethiopian Studies, Moscow*, 26–29 August 1986, 6 voll. (Moscow: USSR Academy of Sciences. Africa Institute, Nauka Publishers, Central Department of Oriental Literature, 1988) vol. VI, 135–148. A critical edition of the text is being prepared by the same for the *Corpus Scriptorum Christianorum Orientalium*. *Scriptores Aethiopici*.

N° 7 (T. 118 = D.E. 7) mainly contains  $Ta^{\circ}amera\ Maryam$ , as well as n° 16 (T. 127 = D.E. 16), and 180 (Museum für Völkerkunde, München, 86–307647) with only seven miracles, but in a ms. belonging in the XV c. Some recent studies on this most relevant work of Ethiopic literature can be added: GETATCHEW HAILE, A note on writing history from forgotten documents, Northeast African Studies 2, 1 (1980) 71–75; On the Writings of Abba Giyorgis Säglawi from Two Inedited Miracles of Mary, Orientalia Christiana Periodica 48 (1982) 65-91; Inside the royal confinement, Northeast African Studies 4, 1 (1982) 19-25; The end of a deserter of the established church of Ethiopia, in G. GOLDENBERG (ed.), Ethiopian Studies. Proceedings of the sixth international conference, Tel Aviv, 14-17 April 1980 (Rotterdam-Boston: A.A. Balkema, 1986) 193-203; D. BARAZ, The Incarnated Icon of Saidnaya Goes West. A Reexamination of the Motif in the Light of New Manuscript Evidence, Le Muséon 108 (1995) 181–191; V. SIX, Water – The Nile — And the Tä<sup>3</sup>amrä Maryam. Miracles of the Virgin Mary in the Ethiopian Version, Aethiopica 2 (1999) 53–68; in addition to the quoted ones (pp. 38– 39), there is at least one further, and larger, Ethiopian edition of the Miracles of Mary: Tasfā Gabra Śellāsē za-beḥēra Bulgā (ed.), Ta'amera Māryām. Emmabētāččen yādarragaččew ta'amer kabezuw eğğeg baţeqitu. Bāla 'arāt mato hulatt me<sup>c</sup>erāf. Ge<sup>c</sup>ezennā amāreññā (Addis Ababā: ba-Tasfā Gabra Śellāsē māttamiyā bēt tāttama, Miyāzyā 1988 °āmata mehrat [= 1995/96 A.D.]) [2059 + 11 not numbered pp.]. The fragmentary text on ff. 2<sup>ra</sup>-3<sup>vb</sup> of ms. n° 7 is very interesting: it seems to belong to a not identified writing of the Pseudo-Clementine literature

N° 10 and 11 (T. 121 and 122 = D.E. 10 and 11) are two *Gadla Samā* tāt, XIV—XV c. While in the catalogues we normally find a progressive numeration of the texts, the presentation here assumes a monthly distribution: this is new, and very important as a clue to the historical interpretation of the collection as a sort of *Menologium*. I must thank the A. very much to have put at my disposal the relevant pages of the catalogue on the two mss. as I was preparing a critical edition of the *Martyrdom of Phileas* (the text is in the ms. n° 10); the study is now under press as *La versione etiopica degli* Acta Phileae *nel* Gadla Samā tāt, in E. LUCCHESI & U. ZANETTI (éds.), Hagiographie égyptienne. Mémorial Paul Devos, *Cahiers d'Orientalisme* (Genève: P. Cramer, 2000). The less than half-explored *Gadla Samā* tāt is still a mine of information and textual evidences on the history of the Christian Egypt, and certainly preserves more than one text translated directly from the Greek in the Aksumite age, such as the *Martyrdom of Phileas* (further details in the article under press).

N° 12 and 13 (Ţ. 123 and 124 = D.E. 12 and 13) constitute together one complete *Gebra Ḥemāmāt*, very relevant for its age, XIV–XV c. N° 69 (Ṭ. 180 = Madḥānē ʿĀlam 1) is a recent ms. of the same work, in a recension which exhibits a number of additions; one of these is *Maṣḥafa dorho*, the Arabic *Vorlage* of which has been very recently identified by E. LUCCHESI (the edition is being prepared).

 $N^{\circ}$  14 and 15 (T. 125 and 126 = D.E. 14 and 15) have very interesting inventaries, thanks to which we can form an idea of the Daga monastic library of the XVI (pp. 112–113: 127 books) and late XVII c. (pp. 115–116: 130 books plus a second series of items: p. 116, Gadla Walattu is certainly Gadla Walatta Pētros) respectively. The Mashafa dorho was considered a book by itself in both of them. The older inventary names the Gadl (as we can guess: the text is not readable) of Mārgos za Tormag, which at the moment is known only in the ms. EMML 7602, 1382–1413 A.D., ff. 2<sup>ra</sup>–6<sup>vc</sup>, with a miniature of the saint in f.1<sup>v</sup> (my most sincere thanks are due here to Dr. GETATCHEW HAILE for helping me in getting a print of this microfilm). The second inventary mentions also Gadla Yāsāy: a large fragment of this very rare text, an unicum among the catalogued mss., is preserved in the ms.  $n^{\circ}$  66 (T. 177 = D.E. 66), but the entire text is present again in the ms. EMML 7602, ff. 74<sup>ra</sup>-82<sup>rb</sup> (text end in T. 177 is found in EMML 7602, f. 80<sup>vc</sup>, l. 12), with a miniature on f. 73°, śe<sup>e</sup>ela qeddus Yāsāy, wrongly indicated as "Abba Isaiah (of Scete)" in M. HELDMAN with S. C. MUNRO-HAY, R. GRIERSON (ed.), African Zion. The sacred art of Ethiopia (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1993) 180 (n° 70). A Gadla Yāsāy is also mentioned in the inventary dated 1425 A.D. in the present Russian National Library, St. Petersburg (and before, Imperial Public Library), Vostočn. 612, f. 161°, see B. A. TURAEV, Efiopskija rukopisi v' S.-Peterburgě, *Zapiski Vostočnago Otdelenija Imperatorskago Russkago Archeologičeskago Obščestva* 17 (1906) 115–248 = *Pamjatniki Efiopskoi Pis'mennosti* 3 (Sanktpeterburg', 1906) 124, first translated and commented upon by C. CONTI ROSSINI, Aethiopica, *Rivista degli Studi Orientali* 10 (1925) 508–511 (§ 42. *Un catalogo di libri dell'anno 1425*), and now by V.M. PLATONOV (who ignores CONTI ROSSINI's article), Notes on the Ethiopian manuscripts of the Russian National Library (St. Petersburg), *St. Petersburg Journal of African Studies* 2 (1993 [1994]) 171–182, esp. 178. The mention of *Gadla Yāsāy*, even if it is not very likely, could be related to the Ethiopian saint Yāsāy, see KINEFE-RIGB ZELLEKE, Bibliography of the Ethiopic Hagiographical Traditions, *Journal of Ethiopian Studies* 13, 2 (1975) 57–102, esp. 96 (n° 169).

 $N^{\circ}$  20 and 31 (T. 131 and 142 = D.E. 20 and 31) are precious Homiliaries of the XV c.: out of 30 and 22 items, there is one which does not seem witnessed by other mss.  $N^{\circ}$  40 (T. 151 = D.E. 40), XIV–XV c., is one of the oldest mss. of the *Ascension of Mary*.

N° 42 (Ț. 153 = D.E. 42), XV c., preserves rare hagiographical pieces, such as the *Gadla Bag*°*u*, which is only present in the mss. EMML 1940 and 1960; the same is true for n° 51 (Ț. 162 = D.E. 51), which is the third known ms. (after EMML 1834 and 2134) of *Gadla Takla Haymānot* in the Dabra Ḥayq version, and for n° 59 (Ț. 170 = D.E. 59), XV–XVI c., a *Gadla Gabra Krestos* (of which Ţ. 164 = D.E. 53 is a copy; see also the aforementioned n° 182) far older than the oldest ms. used by E. CERULLI in his edition: there are however even older mss.: EMML 2796, XIV c., and once again EMML 7602, ff. 90<sup>ra</sup>–95<sup>va</sup>; see also a third old ms. in A. BAUSI, Su alcuni manoscritti presso comunità monastiche dell'Eritrea [I part], *Rassegna di Studi Etiopici* (= *RSE*) 38 (1994 [1996]) 13–69, esp. 65–66 (n° 2, 1453 A.D.).

N° 62 (Ţ. 173 = D.E. 62) is a Gadla Ḥawāryāt, XV c.; the transposition of a portion of the Acts of Matthew and Andrew in the city of Kāhenāt inside the Martyrdom of Bartholomew (as well as a minor one within the Preaching of Bartholomew itself) belongs to the ms. British Library, Or. 678, used by E.A.W. BUDGE in his 1899 edition, but it is absent from this as well as from all the oldest mss. of the work. An anthology and a presentation of the Gadla Ḥawāryāt will be included in the second volume of Écrits apocryphes chrétiens, Pléiade (Paris: Gallimard), which is being prepared at present. N° 64 (Ṭ. 175 = D.E. 64) is a noteworthy ms. of Qalēmenṭos belonging in the XIV c.

 $N^{\circ}$  66 (T. 177 = D.E. 66), besides hagiographical texts (among which the Gadla Yāsāy), contains the Testament of Our Lord in Galilea with the Epistula Apostolorum (the reference to the Testamentum Domini by R. BEYLOT should be cancelled); see now also J.-N. PÉRÈS, L'Épître des Apôtres accompagnée du Testament de notre Seigneur et notre Sauveur Jésus-Christ, Apocryphes. Collection de poche de l'AELAC 5 (Turnhout: Brepols, 1994). There is also an interesting text on the Feast of the Ascension of Our Lord, which is attributed to  $Y\bar{a}^cqob\ ^{\circ}\bar{e}pis$ qopos Sarg<sup>w</sup>as zahagara Disāryā: while Disāryā could be a corruption of Qisāryā, i.e. Caesarea, it seems impossible to identify the author; the text claims to have been translated "from the languages of the Hebrews" ('emqāla 'ebrāwiyān, but probably Syriac) into the "language of the Egyptians" (nagara gebṣāwiyān), almost certainly Arabic; it seems uncertain if this may support the hypothesis of the A. that the text is based on an Arabic source, but is an Ethiopian original creation to be related with the religious controversies of the XV c. The introductory formula before the *incipit* (°akk<sup>w</sup>ātēta °ab wawald etc.) is rather unusual for a treatise, although widespread and very old: see the oldest, epigraphic, example (b'kkth l<'>bm wwldm etc.) in E. BERNAND – A.J. DREWES – R. SCHNEIDER, Recueil des inscriptions de l'Ethiopie des périodes préaxoumite et axoumite. Introduction de Fr. Anfray, 2 voll., Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres (Paris: Diffusion de Boccard, 1991) vol. I, 275 (n° 192).

Coming to part "B", there are some European mss. (n° 72–76, and especially n° 77) which are a real mine of information on the history of the Ethiopian studies since and even before J. LUDOLF's times onwards.

N° 86 (Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, München, Cod. aeth. 127) is a *Nagara Māryām* which has deserved a very long description, both in consideration of its contents and expecially for the paintings (pp. 279–287); it is a pity that in this as in other cases we have no illustrations in the volume (which of course must not be put on the A.), see a similar complaint by M. KNIBB, *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Societies* (1991) 264–265 (rev. of *VOHD* XX, 5).

N° 179 (Museum für Völkerkunde, München, 86–307646) is an illuminated ms. of *Gadla ³Ēwosṭātēwos*, XIV–XV c. (pp. 401–403). The ms. is described as perfectly agreeing with the ms. Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Etiopico 46, which belongs to the I group (together with ms. British Library, Or. 702) of the α recension, according to the classification by G. LUSINI, Studi sul monachesimo eustaziano (secoli XIV–XV), *Studi Africanistici. Serie Etiopica* 3 (Dipartimento di Studi e Ricerche su Africa e Paesi Arabi, Istituto Universitario Orientale, 1993) 35–67, esp. 36–37, 40–42 and 48–49, see also his Sulla tradizione manoscritta degli "Atti" di ³Ēwosṭātēwos (BHO 295 = KRZ 49), *Quaderni Utinensi* 8 (15/16) (1990

[1996]) 353–365; however its *incipit* has an omission which is shared by the II group of the α recension (two mss.: EMML 1636 and Biblioteca Giovardiana, Veroli, n° 9). The distribution and the number of the miracles in this recension is a complicated question, and it is not easy to make a comparison; no doubt the ms. will have to be considered in the new critical edition of *Gadla* <sup>a</sup> Ewosṭātēwos (being prepared by G. LUSINI). The six illuminations in the ms. correspond to the canons of the style identified by M. HELDMAN, which seems to have originated in the northern area of historical Ethiopia, in the monasteries established since the second half of the XIV c. by the followers of <sup>a</sup> Ewosṭātēwos (Dabra Māryām in Qoḥayn, Dabra Bizan etc.); for further references and mss. of the same style see BAUSI, *Su alcuni mss.* [I part], esp. 57–62 and 66–68 (with news on a further ms. of *Gadla* <sup>a</sup> Ewosṭātēwos, of the β recension, and of *Gadla* <sup>a</sup> Absādi); [II part], *RSE* 39 (1995) [1997]) 25–48, esp. 46, and [III part], *RSE* 41 (1997 [1998]) 13–56, esp. 35–36. A *Gadla* <sup>a</sup> Ewosṭātēwos of the β recension is found also in n° 39 (Ţ. 150 = D.E. 39).

As for general remarks, abbreviations are extensively used and well explained (from the biblical books up to the minor signs, pp. 43-46), and the bibliography is very rich (pp. 15–42), although it is not meant to give account of all the new publications, and due place is given to Ethiopian editions (as it was in the previous catalogues VOHD XX, 1–2 and 4–6). For reasons of consistency the system of transliteration, or of transcription (p. 47), is the same used in the volumes of the series (vowel orders  $a u i \bar{a} \bar{e} e o$ , double consonants and sixth order vowelled or vowelless, according to grammatical rules), but the A. (p. 14) seems to agree in general with the suggestions of E. ULLENDORFF, Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies 58 (1995) 611–614 (rev. of VOHD XX, 6), esp. 611–612, who invites to use a single system of transcription for all the Semitic languages of Ethiopia, with quality distinction of vowel orders (i.e. \(\begin{align\*}{c} a \ i \ a \ e \ \pi \ o \end{align\*}). I personally keep on believing that the first system is still the best for the written texts (everyone is aware that it is a compromise solution between transliteration and transcription), for reasons which are well exposed by G. GOLDENBERG, Comparative dictionary of the Ethiopic language, Journal of the American Oriental Society 112 (1992) 78–87 = Studies in Semitic Linguistics. Selected Writings by G.G. (Jerusalem: The Magnes Press, The Hebrew University, 1998) [333]–[342], esp. 81–82. However, the alternative system won the favour of the eds. of *Encyclopaedia* Aethiopica and is recommended in this Journal. On the contrary, in VOHD catalogues labiovelars are transcribed "kw, gw" etc. (see VOHD XV p. X, and XX, 1 p. 39), while a transcription "k", g"" etc. would have been better. A scheme of the ms. description (p. [48]), and detailed indexes complete the volume (dated mss., pp. 452–453, mss. according to literary genres, pp. 454–455, a very complete general index, pp. 456–500, shelfmarks of the mss., pp. 501–507, and addresses of libraries and institutions, p. 508).

As for the texts, whenever possible, the description takes advantage of the VOHD catalogues as well as of others, with references to the paragraphs etc. of previous descriptions. In some cases, the repertories which register Ethiopic versions could have been quoted – such as M. GEERARD, Clavis Apocryphorum Novi Testamenti, Corpus Christianorum (Turnhout: Brepols, 1992), while J.C. HAELEWYCK, Clavis Apocryphorum Veteris Testamenti was published in the same series only in 1998 – but the A. gives also references of old works, which were not apparently quoted before in any other catalogue. The material description is concise and complete. Illuminations are always very carefully described in detail. The added notes deserve a special mention: all the writings of every kind are listed and commented upon, with hypotheses on their date and explanation of the relevant terms, with eventual references to dictionaries and literature: such a careful and satisfactory description can not be overestimated both in the effort it has demanded and in its very good results; as for palaeography, there are references whenever possible to S. UHLIG's main work Athiopische Paläographie, Athiopistische Forschungen 22 (Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag GMBH, 1988).

If there are any shortcomings, these are very minor ones, and sometimes to be put on the VOHD description standard. References to mss. are usually given quoting the pp. of their catalogues, so that we do not know the shelfmark of the ms., which can sometimes cause some problems, see already R.W. COWLEY, Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society (1984) 266–269 (rev. of VOHD XX, 4), esp. 267. Perhaps it would have been more useful to transcribe the dates for commemoration or for reading in correspondence with the texts to which they refer, when possible, even if they are written by a different hand (e.g. pp. 67, 75, 76, 164, 174, 197, 227–228, 311, 417 etc.). Question mark is used to indicate something dubious, but the reader can sometimes be uncertain if the doubt refers to the text which can not be perfectly read or to grammar and meaning, so that while sometimes the reader would expect it where there is not, in other passages it is present while probably there is no need (e.g. p. 204: "]sma 'am'e'ewo (!?) la'Egzi'abhēr"): however one must not forget that the work on the Tanasee collection was carried on on microfilms, and not on mss., and that a number of items are not perfectly readable, and not infrequently nothing can be read at all (e.g. in n° 34 [T. 145 = D.E. 34], almost the same in  $n^{\circ}$  35 [T. 146 = D.E. 35] etc.). P. 67: of course, Libānos or Maṭā<sup>c</sup> does not belong in the group of the Nine Saints. P. 120: Yāṣencānna Krestos: read Yāsne<sup>c</sup>ānna Krestos. P. 124: Fetha Nagest: read Fetha Nagast. P. 133: 1916 Ethiopian Calendar = "1932-33": read "1923-24". P. 160: "A (4ra) sellus geddus

#### Reviews

zayālēllu wa'iyetlēbbo": read "ś" qe" zayālēbbu wa'i"". P. 202: "Iyasu": read "Iyāsu" (as in the Index p. 472). P. 259: "inventuti": read "iuventuti". P. 403: "Akāla Guzāy": read "Akkala Guzāy".

With this last achievement, Germany is the first country in the world to have completed through the *VOHD* enterprise and thanks to the qualified and persevering work of the A. (besides *VOHD* XX, 4 in collaboration with E. HAMMER-SCHMIDT, that under review is her own fourth volume in the *VOHD* series, after XX, 5–6, and *Supplementband* 18) the unique task to put at disposal of the scholars the complete catalogue of all the Ethiopic mss. (and microfilms of mss.) preserved in its libraries and museums: while this could be enough to indicate the importance of this book, it must be remembered that the task has been accomplished in the frame of the epoch-making scientific standard of the *VOHD* catalogues of Ethiopic mss.

Alessandro Bausi